

# Isle of Anglesey County Council Scrutiny Report

<b>Committee:</b>	Corporate Scrutiny
<b>Date:</b>	17/06/2025
<b>Subject:</b>	Canolfan Addysg y Bont Roof Repair – Lessons Learned
<b>Scrutiny Chair:</b>	Councillor Jeff Evans

## 1. Who will be the portfolio holder presenting / leading the report?

Portfolio Holder	Role
Councillor Gary Pritchard	Portfolio holder for Highways, Waste & Property
Service Officer (Supporting)	Role
Huw Percy	Head of Service - Highways, Waste & Property

## 2. Why the Scrutiny Committee is being asked to consider the matter

In order to update the Members on the steps that have been taken, and the lessons learnt since the discovery of a defective roof at Canolfan Addysg y Bont in 2021.

## 3. Role of the Scrutiny Committee and recommendations

- For assurance  
 For recommendation to the Executive  
 For information

**Recommendation(s):**  
 To note the lessons learnt and the steps taken to implement them, as included in the Action Plan included in Appendix A.

## 4. How does the recommendation(s) contribute to the objectives of the Council's Plan?

Implementing changes from the lessons that have been learnt will mitigate the risks involved with any future projects, reduce the likelihood of other similar failures in the future, thus preventing the Council's reserves from having to be used.

## 5. Key scrutiny themes

Key themes the Scrutiny Committee should concentrate on:

1. The lessons learnt since the discovery of the defective roof, namely:
  - The type of roof and the need to include roof construction and finishes as a specific design and build package commissioned from specialist designers / installers.
  - Holding design workshops to facilitate peer reviews.

- Provide officers involved in procurement and design of new buildings with appropriate training.
- Improve document retention arrangements.
- Review the business continuity arrangements for the school.

## 2. Progress on the Action Plan

## 6. Key points / summary

As a result of this matter, processes and decisions have been reviewed and lessons identified relating to:

- Design and Building Work
- Contractual Arrangements
- Document Retention
- Business continuity arrangements

These are detailed in section 4 of the report.

## 7. Impact assessments

### 7.1. Potential impacts on groups protected under the Equality Act 2010

Reduces the likelihood of disruption to pupils, parents, and staff in the future, some of whom may be protected under the Equalities Act 2010

### 7.2. Potential impacts on those experiencing socio-economic disadvantage (strategic decisions)

Reduces the likelihood of disruption to pupils, parents, and staff in the future, some of whom may be experiencing socio-economic disadvantage.

### 7.3. Potential effects on opportunities to use Welsh and not treat the language less favourably than English

No potential effects identified

### 7.4. Potential impact on the Council's Net Zero Carbon target

A decision not to construct "green roofs" moving forward should not have a negative impact on the Council's carbon emissions.

## 8. Financial implications

The cost of replacing the roof was £2.6m. This was funded from the Council's General Reserve. The costs of implementing the Action Plan are minimal. No further expenditure is foreseen.

## 9. Appendices

Appendix A – Action Plan

**10. Report author and background papers**

Meilir Hughes, Chief Property and Assets Officer

## **1. PURPOSE OF THE REPORT**

- 1.1** The purpose of this report is to record the lessons learnt since the discovery of the roof failure at Canolfan Addysg Y Bont, to include:
- steps taken to reduce the probability of premature failure of building components, including roofs in new build schools.
  - steps taken to ensure that the Council maximises the legal recourse available against third parties in the event of any building component failures in future.
- 1.2** The report seeks to assure all stakeholders that the deficiencies in building technology and design, and contract setting, and management arrangements have been acknowledged and are being addressed.

## **2. BACKGROUND**

- 2.1** Canolfan Addysg y Bont was completed in February 2014. During 2021, it became apparent that sections of the roof were at risk of failure and had to be replaced.
- 2.2** In the interest of expediency, the Council authorised the funding of the work to repair / replace the roof from its General Reserves with the intention of pursuing a claim against the main contractor for costs. The remedial work was completed by January 2023 at a total cost of £2.6 million, that included over £418k for scaffolding, and £550k to prepare and provide temporary classrooms.
- 2.3** Officers attempted to recover the cost of the remedial work, as well as any other related costs from the party / parties considered liable for the defective roof by way of an out of court settlement. External solicitors and an expert witness were commissioned to advise on the prospect of success of pursuing a claim through the courts.
- 2.4** Ultimately, an out of court settlement was not reached. In an extraordinary meeting held on 12/12/2024, the Full Council approved officer's recommendations not to issue proceedings, accept that the evidence was against the Council and abandon any claim to recover the expenditure in replacing the school's roof.
- 2.5** Several Services within the Local Authority worked closely with Canolfan Addysg Y Bont to mitigate the impact of the disruption to learners as much as possible. This included relocating some learners to an adjacent secondary school, others to the Leisure Centre (where an area was refurbished for educational purposes) and procuring an outdoor mobile classroom to accommodate other learners. Estyn, the education and training inspectorate for Wales, noted in its inspection report of 2024 on Canolfan Addysg Y Bont: "The school has faced a very challenging period due to problems with the roof of the building. The leadership team, including members of the governing body, has worked relentlessly to overcome this challenge and ensure a minimal effect on provision and pupils' well-being."

### **3. CURRENT POSITION**

- 3.1** Whilst resigned to abandoning any claim to recover the expenditure, assurances have been sought by both the Leadership Team, the Executive and Elected Members that lessons have been learnt and steps taken to guard against a similar situation in future.
- 3.2** The structure of the original roof had an expected life of 50 years, and the green roof covering a minimum expected life of 20 years. The structure of the replacement roof has a similar expected life, and the Single Ply Membrane system has a 20 year guarantee.

We would have expected to have undertaken some works to the original roof covering from 2034, we do not expect to have to undertake substantial work to the replacement roof until 2043 at the earliest.

### **4. LESSONS LEARNT**

The lessons identified are outlined below and most have either been implemented, are in progress, or will be implemented on all future construction projects:

#### **4.1 Design and Building Work**

- 4.1.1** The sedum roof was constructed using timber cassettes. These cassettes had become wet and caused the sedum roof to sag. How or when the cassettes became wet has never been established, although the expert opinion is that it was due to a combination of factors.
- 4.1.2** Moving forward no cold roof SIPS roof construction or any 'green' roofs will be used. Since CAYB was built in 2013, the Property Section have delivered 5 other schools, none of which include either cold roofs or green roof finishes (The only green roof on IOACC Schools is a small roof at the original Ysgol y Graig, it was completed 2009 and is performing well.)
- 4.1.3** On future projects, only fully warm roof SIPS construction build-up and finishes will be specified – with the finishes fully designed and built as specialist packages by specialist designers / installers to include Full Warranties and Condensation Risk Analysis. The replacement roof at CAYB was completed in accordance with this specification.
- 4.1.4** Moving forward, design workshops will be held at various stages of design and construction to review all specialist packages ensuring appropriate peer review and securing input into design choices. Design workshops were held with roofing specialist Bauder and the SIPS Frame manufacturer on the most recent development, and workshops will be used in the future.

#### **4.2 Contractual Arrangements to maximise the legal recourse available**

- 4.2.1** When Canolfan Addysg y Bont was designed, responsibility for designing the roof did not fall solely onto one party.

- 4.2.2 On future complex new systems within projects, the design will be included within the contractor's Designed Portion in order to ensure that liability rests with one party as opposed to several.
- 4.2.3 Future projects will include within the Contract and Tender Documents a stipulation that the Roof System Manufacturer must carry out regular site inspection of the roofing works by their approved installers and to produce and issue detailed reports. This has been implemented on the repairs to CAYB where regular site inspections carried out and reports issued by the Roof Finish manufacturers.
- 4.2.4 Moving forward, a greater number of site Inspections will be carried out with record photographs taken of all stages of project. This has been and will continue to be implemented.
- 4.2.5 On future projects, a detailed Contractor's Design Portion Document will be produced at Tender Stage and for inclusion within the Contract Documents. This will provide further clarification and detailed breakdown of exactly which design elements the main contractor will be responsible for under the contract for the avoidance of doubt. This lesson is an output of the Expert Witness' advice and will be implemented in future projects which include any Contractor's Design Portions.

### **4.3 Document Retention to maximise the legal recourse available**

- 4.3.1 The Council was at a disadvantage when trying to establish where liability for the roof failure rested because several key documents were unavailable. This was because some documents had been left in individual officers' email accounts, as opposed to being saved to shared files, and the drives that could no longer be accessed
- 4.3.2 Improvements to the filing of project correspondence will ensure that all relevant project related documents, including emails are archived appropriately. This lesson is being applied retrospectively to completed projects and will also be implemented for all future projects.

## **5. RECOMMENDATIONS**

- 5.1 To note the lessons learnt and the steps taken to implement them, as included in the Action Plan included in Appendix A.

Appendix A

<b>Action Plan - Canolfan Addysg y Bont Defective Roof – Lessons Learnt</b>					
<b>No</b>	<b>Action</b>	<b>Complete By</b>	<b>Responsibility</b>	<b>Update</b>	<b>RAG Status</b>
<b>Design and Building Work</b>					
1	Only design / accept warm roof designs moving forward	28/02/2025	Chief Property and Assets Officer	In place	G
2	Introduce design workshop and peer reviews	30/06/2025	Chief Property and Assets Officer	This will be a continuous process and will apply to the design process of significant works / new build projects. No such work is currently ongoing.	G
3	Ensure that officers undertake regular site visits on all construction projects, to include record photographs	30/06/2025	Chief Property and Assets Officer	This will be a continuous process and will apply to the design process of significant works / new build projects. No such work is currently ongoing.	G
<b>Contractual Arrangements</b>					
4	All officers involved in procurement to complete the appropriate procurement training	31/03/2025	Chief Property and Assets Officer	Complete for current staff and arrangements in place to ensure that all new staff receive suitable training	G
5.	Officers within the Design Section to undertake JCT Contract Training to include Design Responsibility and Contractors	30/09/2025	Chief Property and Assets Officer	Architectural Services Manager has attended relevant Chartered Institute of Building course 07.05.25.	G

	Design Portion within the construction contract				
<b>Document Retention</b>					
6	All documents relating to Property to be saved in the relevant CPM module or associated Sharepoint file	30/09/2025	Chief Property and Assets Officer	The Property Section has established a new SharePoint filing structure which holds all newly created files in a prescribed format. Historical information from the previous filing system is currently being migrated.	Y
7	Ensure that record photographs are taken by officers during site visits	30/06/2025	Chief Property and Assets Officer	This will be a continuous process and will apply to the design process of significant works / new build projects.	G
<b>Other</b>					
8	Review and update the business continuity plan for Canolfan Addysg y Bont	31/08/2025	CAyB / Learning Service	In progress – review currently taking place	Y

STEP STATUS KEY			
No progress	Off track	On track	Completed
R	A	Y	G